Convex Analysis at Infinity An Introduction to Astral Space

> Miro Dudík Rob Schapire Matus Telgarsky

further reading at: [aka.ms/astral](https://aka.ms/astral)

## Convex functions



## Convex functions



- minimizing convex functions is basis for many methods in machine learning and statistics (and other fields)
	- e.g.: maximum likelihood, maximum entropy, linear regression, logistic regression, boosting, SVM's, ...

# Convex functions





- e.g.: maximum likelihood, maximum entropy, linear regression, logistic regression, boosting, SVM's, ...
- convex functions are really nice!
	- local minimum must be global minimum
	- if gradient  $= 0$  then must be global minimum
	- usually easier to find and analyze minimization algorithms
	- beautiful properties





- problem: some convex functions have no finite minimizer
	- function then must be minimized by sequence heading "to infinity"



- problem: some convex functions have no finite minimizer
	- function then must be minimized by sequence heading "to infinity"
	- certainly includes cases of practical interest
	- analyzing convergence often requires carefully tailored techniques



- problem: some convex functions have no finite minimizer
	- function then must be minimized by sequence heading "to infinity"
	- certainly includes cases of practical interest
	- analyzing convergence often requires carefully tailored techniques
- this talk: develop theory for studying such minimizers at infinity

# Example: exponential function



• e.g.: 
$$
f(x) = e^x
$$

#### Example: exponential function



- e.g.:  $f(x) = e^x$
- no finite point  $x \in \mathbb{R}$  where minimum attained
- instead, minimized by any sequence  $(x_t)$  with  $x_t \to -\infty$
- wish could say: "minimized at  $-\infty$ "

#### Example: exponential function



- no finite point  $x \in \mathbb{R}$  where minimum attained
- instead, minimized by any sequence  $(x_t)$  with  $x_t \to -\infty$
- wish could say: "minimized at  $-\infty$ "
- can do by:
	- extending  $\mathbb R$  to include  $\pm \infty$ :

 $\overline{\mathbb{R}} = \mathbb{R} \cup \{-\infty, +\infty\} = [-\infty, +\infty]$ 



- no finite point  $x \in \mathbb{R}$  where minimum attained
- instead, minimized by any sequence  $(x_t)$  with  $x_t \to -\infty$
- wish could say: "minimized at  $-\infty$ "
- can do by:
	- extending  $\mathbb R$  to include  $\pm \infty$ :

$$
\overline{\mathbb{R}}=\mathbb{R}\cup\{-\infty,+\infty\}=[-\infty,+\infty]
$$

• extending f to  $\overline{\mathbb{R}}$  by setting:  $f(-\infty) = 0$  and  $f(+\infty) = +\infty$ 



• maybe can extend derivatives so that  $f'(-\infty) = 0$ 



- is continuous over  $\overline{\mathbb{R}}$
- attains minimum at  $-\infty$
- "feels" convex
- maybe can extend derivatives so that  $f'(-\infty) = 0$
- in  $n = 1$  dimensions, seems clear how to
	- add "points at infinity"
	- extend functions to enlarged space, capturing minimizers at infinity



- is continuous over  $\overline{\mathbb{R}}$
- attains minimum at  $-\infty$
- "feels" convex
- maybe can extend derivatives so that  $f'(-\infty) = 0$
- in  $n = 1$  dimensions, seems clear how to
	- add "points at infinity"
	- extend functions to enlarged space, capturing minimizers at infinity
- what about in  $n \geq 2$  dimensions?



• extend  $\mathbb{R}^n$  to include points at infinity



- extend  $\mathbb{R}^n$  to include points at infinity
- aim to reveal structure of how convex functions behave at infinity

## Goals

- extend  $\mathbb{R}^n$  to include points at infinity
- aim to reveal structure of how convex functions behave at infinity
- trying to build up foundations so relatively easy, for instance, to prove convergence of algorithms

## Goals

- extend  $\mathbb{R}^n$  to include points at infinity
- aim to reveal structure of how convex functions behave at infinity
- trying to build up foundations so relatively easy, for instance, to prove convergence of algorithms
- hope to make study of convex functions more "complete" and "regular"
	- e.g., so every convex function, when extended to new space, has a minimizer

## Goals

- extend  $\mathbb{R}^n$  to include points at infinity
- aim to reveal structure of how convex functions behave at infinity
- trying to build up foundations so relatively easy, for instance, to prove convergence of algorithms
- hope to make study of convex functions more "complete" and "regular"
	- e.g., so every convex function, when extended to new space, has a minimizer
- want compatible with key notions of convex analysis

• if only working in  $\mathbb{Q} =$  rationals, then no number equals length of diagonal of a unit square



• if only working in  $\mathbb{Q} =$  rationals, then no number equals length of diagonal of a unit square



2

• can approach value with sequences in  $\mathbb{Q}$ : 1  $\frac{1}{1}$ ,  $\frac{3}{2}$  $\frac{3}{2}$ ,  $\frac{7}{5}$  $\frac{7}{5}, \frac{17}{12}, \frac{41}{29}, \frac{99}{70}, \frac{239}{169}, \ldots \rightarrow$ √ 2  $1, 1.4, 1.41, 1.414, 1.4142, 1.41421, ... \rightarrow$ √

• if only working in  $\mathbb{Q} =$  rationals, then no number equals length of diagonal of a unit square



√ 2

• can approach value with sequences in  $\mathbb{Q}$ : 1  $\frac{1}{1}$ ,  $\frac{3}{2}$  $\frac{3}{2}$ ,  $\frac{7}{5}$  $\frac{7}{5}, \frac{17}{12}, \frac{41}{29}, \frac{99}{70}, \frac{239}{169}, \ldots \rightarrow$ √ 2  $1, 1.4, 1.41, 1.414, 1.4142, 1.41421, ... \rightarrow$ 

• so don't "need" reals (can just work over sequences of rationals)

• if only working in  $\mathbb{Q} =$  rationals, then no number equals length of diagonal of a unit square



• can approach value with sequences in  $\mathbb{Q}$ : 1  $\frac{1}{1}$ ,  $\frac{3}{2}$  $\frac{3}{2}$ ,  $\frac{7}{5}$  $\frac{7}{5}, \frac{17}{12}, \frac{41}{29}, \frac{99}{70}, \frac{239}{169}, \ldots \rightarrow$ √ 2

 $1, 1.4, 1.41, 1.414, 1.4142, 1.41421, ... \rightarrow$ √ 2

- so don't "need" reals (can just work over sequences of rationals)
- far preferable to extend  $\mathbb Q$  to  $\mathbb R$ 
	- much more complete, regular, well-structured

# Analogy (cont.)

- in same way, can continue to use sequences to study minimizers of convex functions
	- might be much nicer to study minimizers at infinity as mathematical objects in their own right
	- can hope larger space would be more complete, regular, and revealing of structure

#### This work

- introduce astral space, extension of  $\mathbb{R}^n$  with points at infinity
- extend functions on  $\mathbb{R}^n$  to astral space
- study key properties and topics extended to astral space, especially from convex analysis

## **Outline**

- what can minimizers at infinity look like?
- constructing astral space
- what are astral points like?
- extending functions to astral space
- convergence of iterative algorithms

## **Notation**

- $n =$  dimension
- scalars (in  $\mathbb{R}$ ):  $x, y, \ldots$
- vectors (in  $\mathbb{R}^n$ ):  $x, u, v, \ldots$ 
	- as tuple:  $\mathbf{x} = (x_1, \ldots, x_n)$

## **Notation**

- $n =$  dimension
- scalars (in  $\mathbb{R}$ ):  $x, y, \ldots$
- vectors (in  $\mathbb{R}^n$ ):  $x, u, v, \ldots$ 
	- as tuple:  $\mathbf{x} = (x_1, \ldots, x_n)$
- all sequences indexed by  $t = 1, 2, \ldots$
- limits and convergence always as  $t \to +\infty$
- $(x_t)$  is sequence  $x_1, x_2, \ldots$

## **Outline**

#### • what can minimizers at infinity look like?

- constructing astral space
- what are astral points like?
- extending functions to astral space
- convergence of iterative algorithms

## Minimizers at infinity

- given convex function  $f : \mathbb{R}^n \to \overline{\mathbb{R}}$
- if no finite minimizer, can only be minimized by sequence  $(x_t)$ to infinity
- what can such "minimizers at infinity" look like?

#### Minimizers at infinity

- given convex function  $f : \mathbb{R}^n \to \overline{\mathbb{R}}$
- if no finite minimizer, can only be minimized by sequence  $(x_t)$ to infinity
- what can such "minimizers at infinity" look like?
- in  $n = 1$  dimensions, can only converge to  $\pm \infty$

## Minimizers at infinity

- given convex function  $f : \mathbb{R}^n \to \overline{\mathbb{R}}$
- if no finite minimizer, can only be minimized by sequence  $(x_t)$ to infinity
- what can such "minimizers at infinity" look like?
- in  $n = 1$  dimensions, can only converge to  $\pm \infty$
- in  $n > 2$  dimensions, many possibilities
	- for example...



• in 
$$
\mathbb{R}^2
$$
, say

$$
f(x) = f(x_1, x_2) = e^{-x_1} + (x_2 - x_1)^2
$$

#### Example: Diagonal valley



• in 
$$
\mathbb{R}^2
$$
, say

$$
f(\mathbf{x}) = f(x_1, x_2) = e^{-x_1} + (x_2 - x_1)^2
$$
  
\n
$$
\downarrow
$$
  
\n
$$
x_1 \to +\infty
$$
  
\n
$$
\downarrow
$$
  
\n
$$
x_2 - x_1 \to 0
$$

• to minimize, must follow "diagonal valley" • e.g., set  $x_1 = x_2 = t$  and let  $t \rightarrow +\infty$ 

• i.e.,  $x_t = (t, t)$ :  $f(x_t) = f(t, t) = e^{-t} \to 0$ 

#### Example: Diagonal valley



• in 
$$
\mathbb{R}^2
$$
, say

$$
f(\mathbf{x}) = f(x_1, x_2) = \underbrace{e^{-x_1}}_{x_1 \to +\infty} + \underbrace{(x_2 - x_1)^2}_{x_2 - x_1 \to 0}
$$

• to minimize, must follow "diagonal valley"

• e.g., set  $x_1 = x_2 = t$  and let  $t \to +\infty$ 

• i.e., 
$$
x_t = (t, t)
$$
:  $f(x_t) = f(t, t) = e^{-t} \to 0$ 

• matters how sequence goes to infinity!

#### Example: Diagonal valley


• in 
$$
\mathbb{R}^2
$$
, say

Example: Diagonal valley

$$
f(\mathbf{x}) = f(x_1, x_2) = e^{-x_1} + (x_2 - x_1)^2
$$
  
\n
$$
\downarrow
$$
  
\n
$$
x_1 \to +\infty
$$
  
\n
$$
\downarrow
$$
  
\n
$$
x_2 - x_1 \to 0
$$

• to minimize, must follow "diagonal valley"

• e.g., set  $x_1 = x_2 = t$  and let  $t \rightarrow +\infty$ 

• i.e., 
$$
x_t = (t, t)
$$
:  $f(x_t) = f(t, t) = e^{-t} \to 0$ 

- matters how sequence goes to infinity!
	- direction matters



• in 
$$
\mathbb{R}^2
$$
, say

Example: Diagonal valley

$$
f(\mathbf{x}) = f(x_1, x_2) = e^{-x_1} + (x_2 - x_1)^2
$$
  
\n
$$
\downarrow
$$
  
\n
$$
x_1 \to +\infty
$$
  
\n
$$
\downarrow
$$
  
\n
$$
x_2 - x_1 \to 0
$$

• to minimize, must follow "diagonal valley"

• e.g., set  $x_1 = x_2 = t$  and let  $t \rightarrow +\infty$ 

• i.e., 
$$
x_t = (t, t)
$$
:  $f(x_t) = f(t, t) = e^{-t} \to 0$ 

- matters how sequence goes to infinity!
	- direction matters
	- offset also matters

• can every convex function be minimized along a ray?



- can every convex function be minimized along a ray? no!
- e.g., in  $\mathbb{R}^2$ , let

$$
f(\mathbf{x}) = f(x_1, x_2) = e^{-x_1} + e^{-x_2+}
$$

• to minimize, need:

•  $x_1 \rightarrow +\infty$ 



- can every convex function be minimized along a ray? no!
- e.g., in  $\mathbb{R}^2$ , let

$$
f(\mathbf{x}) = f(x_1, x_2) = e^{-x_1} + e^{-x_2 + x}
$$

- to minimize, need:
	- $x_1 \rightarrow +\infty$
	- $x_2 \rightarrow +\infty$  much faster than  $x_1$ so that  $-x_2 + x_1^2/2 \rightarrow -\infty$



- can every convex function be minimized along a ray? no!
- e.g., in  $\mathbb{R}^2$ , let

$$
f(\mathbf{x}) = f(x_1, x_2) = e^{-x_1} + e^{-x_2 +}
$$

- to minimize, need:
	- $x_1 \rightarrow +\infty$
	- $x_2 \rightarrow +\infty$  much faster than  $x_1$ so that  $-x_2 + x_1^2/2 \rightarrow -\infty$
	- e.g.  $x_t = (t, t^2)$



- can every convex function be minimized along a ray? no!
- e.g., in  $\mathbb{R}^2$ , let

$$
f(\mathbf{x}) = f(x_1, x_2) = e^{-x_1} + e^{-x_2 +}
$$

- to minimize, need:
	- $x_1 \rightarrow +\infty$
	- $x_2 \rightarrow +\infty$  much faster than  $x_1$ so that  $-x_2 + x_1^2/2 \rightarrow -\infty$
	- e.g.  $x_t = (t, t^2)$
- no minimizing sequence along straight ray



- can every convex function be minimized along a ray? no!
- e.g., in  $\mathbb{R}^2$ , let

$$
\begin{array}{ll}\n\text{convex function be} \\
\text{along a ray? no!} \\
\text{let} \\
f(x) = f(x_1, x_2) = e^{-x_1} + e^{-x_2 + x_1^2/2} \\
\end{array}
$$

- to minimize, need:
	- $x_1 \rightarrow +\infty$
	- $x_2 \rightarrow +\infty$  much faster than  $x_1$

so that 
$$
-x_2 + x_1^2/2 \rightarrow -\infty
$$

- e.g.  $x_t = (t, t^2)$
- no minimizing sequence along straight ray
- how to construct space capturing such minimizers at infinity?

## **Outline**

- what can minimizers at infinity look like?
- constructing astral space
- what are astral points like?
- extending functions to astral space
- convergence of iterative algorithms



• sequences to infinity don't converge because nothing to converge to



- sequences to infinity don't converge because nothing to converge to
- $\bullet$  idea: add "new" points to  $\mathbb{R}^n$  that can be limits of such sequences

### Basic idea

- sequences to infinity don't converge because nothing to converge to
- $\bullet$  idea: add "new" points to  $\mathbb{R}^n$  that can be limits of such sequences
- key questions:
	- which sequences should have limits?
	- when should two sequences have same limit?

### Basic idea

- sequences to infinity don't converge because nothing to converge to
- $\bullet$  idea: add "new" points to  $\mathbb{R}^n$  that can be limits of such sequences
- key questions:
	- which sequences should have limits?
	- when should two sequences have same limit?
- once answered, can construct space:
	- add "new" points to be limits of each group of sequences that should all have same limit



• any sequence following ray to infinity should have a limit e.g.,  $x_t = (2t, t) = t$ **v** where  $v = (2, 1)$ 



• any sequence following ray to infinity should have a limit e.g.,  $x_t = (2t, t) = t$ **v** where  $v = (2, 1)$ 



- any sequence following ray to infinity should have a limit e.g.,  $x_t = (2t, t) = t$ **v** where  $v = (2, 1)$
- what sequences should have same limit?



- any sequence following ray to infinity should have a limit e.g.,  $x_t = (2t, t) = t$ **v** where  $v = (2, 1)$
- what sequences should have same limit?
	- e.g., if change rate converging to infinity



- say shift sequence by fixed offset
- $x_t = (2t, t) = t$ **v** where  $v = (2, 1)$  $x'_t = (2t - 1, t + 2) = t\mathbf{v} + \mathbf{w}$  where  $\mathbf{w} = (-1, 2)$



- say shift sequence by fixed offset
- $x_t = (2t, t) = t$ **v** where  $v = (2, 1)$  $x'_t = (2t - 1, t + 2) = t\mathbf{v} + \mathbf{w}$  where  $\mathbf{w} = (-1, 2)$
- should two sequences have same limit?



- say shift sequence by fixed offset
- $x_t = (2t, t) = t$ **v** where  $v = (2, 1)$  $x'_t = (2t - 1, t + 2) = t\mathbf{v} + \mathbf{w}$  where  $\mathbf{w} = (-1, 2)$
- should two sequences have same limit?
- we believe no because:
	- offset matters for minimization
	- in applications, often care about such offsets, not just overall direction of minimization

# A basic principle

• how to capture these intuitions?

### A basic principle

- how to capture these intuitions?
- basic principle: focus on limits in every direction  $\mathbf{u} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ i.e., along one-dimensional projections of the sequence

### A basic principle

- how to capture these intuitions?
- basic principle: focus on limits in every direction  $\mathbf{u} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ i.e., along one-dimensional projections of the sequence
	- for example...



• as before:  $x_t = (2t, t) = t$ **v** where **v** =  $(2, 1)$  $x'_t = (2t - 1, t + 2) = t\mathbf{v} + \mathbf{w}$  where  $\mathbf{w} = (-1, 2)$ 









• so: in some direction, sequences have different limits



• therefore: require  $(x_t)$  and  $(x'_t)$  to have different limits



• which sequences  $(x_t)$  should have limits?



- which sequences  $(x_t)$  should have limits?
	- exactly those that converge in all directions
	- meaning:  $\lim(x_t \cdot u)$  exists for all  $u \in \mathbb{R}^n$

#### Our approach

- which sequences  $(x_t)$  should have limits?
	- exactly those that converge in all directions
	- meaning:  $\lim(x_t \cdot u)$  exists for all  $u \in \mathbb{R}^n$

• when should two sequences  $(x_t)$  and  $(x'_t)$  have same limit?

#### Our approach

- which sequences  $(x_t)$  should have limits?
	- exactly those that converge in all directions
	- meaning:  $\lim(x_t \cdot u)$  exists for all  $u \in \mathbb{R}^n$
- when should two sequences  $(x_t)$  and  $(x'_t)$  have same limit?
	- exactly when they are all-directions equivalent, i.e., have same limit in every direction
	- meaning:  $\lim(x_t \cdot u) = \lim(x'_t \cdot u)$  for all  $u \in \mathbb{R}^n$

#### Our approach

- which sequences  $(x_t)$  should have limits?
	- exactly those that converge in all directions
	- meaning:  $\lim(x_t \cdot u)$  exists for all  $u \in \mathbb{R}^n$
- when should two sequences  $(x_t)$  and  $(x'_t)$  have same limit?
	- exactly when they are all-directions equivalent, i.e., have same limit in every direction

• meaning:  $\lim(x_t \cdot u) = \lim(x'_t \cdot u)$  for all  $u \in \mathbb{R}^n$ 

• note that limits can be in  $\overline{\mathbb{R}}$ 



#### • when expand  $\mathbb{R}^n$  according to these criteria, get

 $\overline{\mathbb{R}^n}$  = astral space



• when expand  $\mathbb{R}^n$  according to these criteria, get

 $\overline{\mathbb{R}^n}$  = astral space

• in  $n = 1$  dimensions, only add  $\pm \infty$  so  $\overline{\mathbb{R}^1}$  same as  $\overline{\mathbb{R}}$
- astral space is compact
	- very powerful property
		- (e.g. to prove convergence of iterative algorithms)

• astral space is compact

- very powerful property
	- (e.g. to prove convergence of iterative algorithms)
- every linear function can be extended continuously

- astral space is compact
	- very powerful property
		- (e.g. to prove convergence of iterative algorithms)
- every linear function can be extended continuously
	- implies "anything linear" likely to behave "nicely" in astral space
		- especially relevant to convex analysis
		- means can generalize: linear maps, hyperplanes, halfspaces, convex sets and functions, conjugates, differential theory

- astral space is compact
	- very powerful property
		- (e.g. to prove convergence of iterative algorithms)
- every linear function can be extended continuously
	- implies "anything linear" likely to behave "nicely" in astral space
		- especially relevant to convex analysis
		- means can generalize: linear maps, hyperplanes, halfspaces, convex sets and functions, conjugates, differential theory
- astral space is not a vector space, nor a metric space

# **Outline**

- what can minimizers at infinity look like?
- constructing astral space
- what are astral points like?
- extending functions to astral space
- convergence of iterative algorithms



• simplest sequence to infinity is along ray from origin:  $\mathbf{x}_t = t\mathbf{v}$  for some  $\mathbf{v} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ 



- simplest sequence to infinity is along ray from origin:  $\mathbf{x}_t = t\mathbf{v}$  for some  $\mathbf{v} \in \mathbb{R}^n$
- converges in all directions



- simplest sequence to infinity is along ray from origin:  $\mathbf{x}_t = t\mathbf{v}$  for some  $\mathbf{v} \in \mathbb{R}^n$
- converges in all directions
- therefore, has limit in  $\overline{\mathbb{R}^n}$  called astron  $\omega v$ :

 $\omega \mathbf{v} = \lim t \mathbf{v}$ 



- simplest sequence to infinity is along ray from origin:  $\mathbf{x}_t = t\mathbf{v}$  for some  $\mathbf{v} \in \mathbb{R}^n$
- converges in all directions
- therefore, has limit in  $\overline{\mathbb{R}^n}$  called astron  $\omega v$ :

 $\omega \mathbf{v} = \lim t \mathbf{v}$ 

• turn out to be building blocks for all astral points



• say  $\mathbf{x}_t = t^2 \mathbf{v}_1 + t \mathbf{v}_2 + \mathbf{q}$  for some  $\mathbf{v}_1, \mathbf{v}_2, \mathbf{q} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ 



- say  $\mathbf{x}_t = t^2 \mathbf{v}_1 + t \mathbf{v}_2 + \mathbf{q}$  for some  $\mathbf{v}_1, \mathbf{v}_2, \mathbf{q} \in \mathbb{R}^n$
- intuitively:
	- converges to infinity most strongly in direction of  $v_1$
	- secondary convergence to infinity in direction of  $\nu_2$
	- finite shift or offset by **q**



- say  $\mathbf{x}_t = t^2 \mathbf{v}_1 + t \mathbf{v}_2 + \mathbf{q}$  for some  $\mathbf{v}_1, \mathbf{v}_2, \mathbf{q} \in \mathbb{R}^n$
- intuitively:
	- converges to infinity most strongly in direction of  $v_1$
	- secondary convergence to infinity in direction of  $v_2$
	- finite shift or offset by  $q$
- converges in all directions, so has astral limit  $\bar{x}$



- say  $\mathbf{x}_t = t^2 \mathbf{v}_1 + t \mathbf{v}_2 + \mathbf{q}$  for some  $\mathbf{v}_1, \mathbf{v}_2, \mathbf{q} \in \mathbb{R}^n$
- intuitively:
	- converges to infinity most strongly in direction of  $v_1$
	- secondary convergence to infinity in direction of  $\nu_2$
	- finite shift or offset by **q**
- converges in all directions, so has astral limit  $\bar{x}$
- turns out, can write in form:

$$
\overline{\mathbf{x}} = \underbrace{\omega \mathbf{v}_1 + \omega \mathbf{v}_2}_{\text{astrons}} + \mathbf{q}
$$

- operation  $+$  is leftward addition:
	- similar to vector addition but not commutative
	- gives kind of "dominance" to term on left

### Representing astral points

• in general: every astral point  $\bar{x}$  can be written in form

$$
\overline{x} = \underbrace{\omega v_1 + \cdots + \omega v_k}_{\text{astrons}} + \underbrace{q}_{\text{finite}_{\text{part}}}
$$

for some orthonormal  $\mathbf{v}_1,\ldots,\mathbf{v}_k \in \mathbb{R}^n$ and some  $\boldsymbol{q} \in \mathbb{R}^n$  orthogonal to the  $\boldsymbol{\mathsf{v}}_i$ 's

### Representing astral points

• in general: every astral point  $\bar{x}$  can be written in form

$$
\overline{x} = \underbrace{\omega v_1 + \cdots + \omega v_k}_{\text{astrons}} + \underbrace{q}_{\text{finite}}_{\text{part}}
$$

for some orthonormal  $\mathbf{v}_1,\ldots,\mathbf{v}_k \in \mathbb{R}^n$ and some  $\boldsymbol{q} \in \mathbb{R}^n$  orthogonal to the  $\boldsymbol{\mathsf{v}}_i$ 's

- astral rank  $= k$  (number of astrons in  $\bar{x}$ 's representation)
	- astral rank  $= 0 \Rightarrow \overline{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$
	- astral rank  $= 1 \Rightarrow \bar{x}$  is limit of sequence along ray

# **Outline**

- what can minimizers at infinity look like?
- constructing astral space
- what are astral points like?
- extending functions to astral space
- convergence of iterative algorithms

Extending a function to astral space

- given convex  $f : \mathbb{R}^n \to \overline{\mathbb{R}}$
- want to extend to astral space:

 $\bar{f}: \overline{\mathbb{R}^n} \to \overline{\mathbb{R}}$ 

Extending a function to astral space

- given convex  $f : \mathbb{R}^n \to \overline{\mathbb{R}}$
- want to extend to astral space:

 $\bar{f}: \overline{\mathbb{R}^n} \to \overline{\mathbb{R}}$ 

• how to define?

# Example: exponential function



• say 
$$
f(x) = e^x
$$
 for  $x \in \mathbb{R}$ 

### Example: exponential function



• say  $f(x) = e^x$  for  $x \in \mathbb{R}$ 

- want to define  $\bar{f}$  = extension of f to  $\bar{\mathbb{R}} = \overline{\mathbb{R}^1}$ .
	- $\bar{f}(-\infty) = 0$  because: if  $x_t \to -\infty$  then  $f(x_t) \to 0$
	- $\bar{f}(+\infty) = +\infty$  because: if  $x_t \to +\infty$  then  $f(x_t) \to +\infty$

### Example: exponential function



• say  $f(x) = e^x$  for  $x \in \mathbb{R}$ 

- want to define  $\bar{f}$  = extension of f to  $\bar{\mathbb{R}} = \overline{\mathbb{R}^1}$ .
	- $\bar{f}(-\infty) = 0$  because: if  $x_t \to -\infty$  then  $f(x_t) \to 0$

•  $\bar{f}(+\infty) = +\infty$  because: if  $x_t \to +\infty$  then  $f(x_t) \to +\infty$ 

• only way to extend to  $\overline{\mathbb{R}}$  continuously

- in general, given convex  $f : \mathbb{R}^n \to \overline{\mathbb{R}}$
- want to define its extension  $\overline{f}: \overline{\mathbb{R}^n} \to \overline{\mathbb{R}}$
- given  $\bar{x}$ , how to define  $\bar{f}(\bar{x})$ ?

- in general, given convex  $f : \mathbb{R}^n \to \overline{\mathbb{R}}$
- want to define its extension  $\overline{f}: \overline{\mathbb{R}^n} \to \overline{\mathbb{R}}$
- given  $\bar{x}$ , how to define  $\bar{f}(\bar{x})$ ?
- say  $\lim f(x_t)$  exists and is the same for every sequence  $x_t \rightarrow \overline{x}$

- in general, given convex  $f : \mathbb{R}^n \to \overline{\mathbb{R}}$
- want to define its extension  $\bar{f}: \overline{\mathbb{R}^n} \to \overline{\mathbb{R}}$
- given  $\bar{x}$ , how to define  $\bar{f}(\bar{x})$ ?
- say  $\lim_{t \to \infty} f(x_t)$  exists and is the same for every sequence  $x_t \rightarrow \overline{x}$

• then only reasonable to set:  $f(\overline{x}) = \lim f(x_t)$  for any (and every) sequence  $x_t \to \overline{x}$ 

- in general, given convex  $f : \mathbb{R}^n \to \overline{\mathbb{R}}$
- want to define its extension  $\overline{f}$  :  $\overline{\mathbb{R}^n} \to \overline{\mathbb{R}}$
- given  $\bar{x}$ , how to define  $\bar{f}(\bar{x})$ ?
- say  $\lim_{t \to \infty} f(x_t)$  exists and is the same for every sequence  $x_t \rightarrow \overline{x}$

• then only reasonable to set:  $\bar{f}(\overline{x}) = \lim f(x_t)$  for any (and every) sequence  $x_t \to \overline{x}$ 

• if holds for all  $\overline{x} \in \overline{\mathbb{R}^n}$  then  $\overline{f}$  is (unique) continuous extension of f to  $\overline{\mathbb{R}^n}$ 

• say 
$$
f(x) = x \cdot u
$$
 for some  $u \in \mathbb{R}^n$  [e.g.,  $f(x_1, x_2) = 2x_1 - x_2$ ]

- say  $f(x) = x \cdot u$  for some  $u \in \mathbb{R}^n$  [e.g.,  $f(x_1, x_2) = 2x_1 x_2$ ]
- if  $x_t \rightarrow \overline{x}$  then

$$
\lim f(\mathbf{x}_t) = \lim (\mathbf{x}_t \cdot \mathbf{u})
$$

exists and same for every sequence converging to  $\bar{x}$ [by construction!]

• say  $f(x) = x \cdot u$  for some  $u \in \mathbb{R}^n$  [e.g.,  $f(x_1, x_2) = 2x_1 - x_2$ ]  $\bullet$  if  $\bullet$   $\overline{v}$  +k

$$
\text{If } \mathbf{x}_t \to \mathbf{x} \text{ then}
$$

$$
\lim f(\mathbf{x}_t) = \lim (\mathbf{x}_t \cdot \mathbf{u})
$$

exists and same for every sequence converging to  $\bar{x}$ [by construction!]

• therefore, f has continuous extension  $\bar{f}$ 

• say  $f(x) = x \cdot u$  for some  $u \in \mathbb{R}^n$  [e.g.,  $f(x_1, x_2) = 2x_1 - x_2$ ] • if  $x_t \rightarrow \overline{x}$  then

$$
\lim f(\mathbf{x}_t) = \lim (\mathbf{x}_t \cdot \mathbf{u})
$$

exists and same for every sequence converging to  $\bar{x}$ [by construction!]

- therefore, f has continuous extension  $\bar{f}$
- so: every linear function can be continuously extended to  $\mathbb{R}^n$

# Example: Diagonal valley





$$
f(x_1,x_2) = e^{-x_1} + (x_2 - x_1)^2
$$







$$
f(x_1,x_2) = e^{-x_1} + (x_2 - x_1)^2
$$

• can show extends continuously to  $\overline{\mathbb{R}^2}$ 







$$
f(x_1,x_2) = e^{-x_1} + (x_2 - x_1)^2
$$

- can show extends continuously to  $\overline{\mathbb{R}^2}$
- saw f minimized by  $x_t = tv$  where  $v = (1, 1)$

# Example: Diagonal valley





$$
f(x_1,x_2)=e^{-x_1}+(x_2-x_1)^2
$$

- can show extends continuously to  $\mathbb{R}^2$
- saw f minimized by  $x_t = tv$  where  $v = (1, 1)$
- converges to astron  $\omega$ **v**
- $\bar{f}$  minimized at  $\bar{x} = \omega v$

# Example: Diagonal valley





$$
f(x_1,x_2)=e^{-x_1}+(x_2-x_1)^2
$$

- can show extends continuously to  $\mathbb{R}^2$
- saw f minimized by  $x_t = tv$  where  $v = (1, 1)$
- converges to astron  $\omega$ **v**
- $\bar{f}$  minimized at  $\bar{x} = \omega v$
- since continuous,  $f$  also minimized by any sequence  $\mathbf{x}'_t \to \omega \mathbf{v}$

# Extending functions in general

• f might not have continuous extension

# Extending functions in general

• f might not have continuous extension

#### • continuous case:

 $\bar{f}(\bar{x}) =$  $\lim f(\mathbf{x}_t)$  over all sequences  $\mathbf{x}_t \to \overline{\mathbf{x}}$
## Extending functions in general

- f might not have continuous extension
- general case:  $\bar{f}(\bar{x}) =$  minimum of lim  $f(x_t)$  over all sequences  $x_t \to \bar{x}$

# Extending functions in general

- f might not have continuous extension
- general case:  $\bar{f}(\bar{x}) =$  minimum of lim  $f(x_t)$  over all sequences  $x_t \to \bar{x}$
- properties:
	- $\bar{f}$  must attain minimizer in  $\bar{\mathbb{R}}^n$  [since compact]

# Extending functions in general

- f might not have continuous extension
- general case:  $\bar{f}(\bar{x}) =$  minimum of lim  $f(x_t)$  over all sequences  $x_t \to \bar{x}$
- properties:
	- $\bar{f}$  must attain minimizer in  $\overline{\mathbb{R}^n}$  [since compact]
	- $\overline{x}$  minimizes  $\overline{f}$  iff

there exists sequence  $x_t \to \overline{x}$  minimizing f





- in  $\mathbb{R}^2$ , recall:  $f(x_1, x_2) = e^{-x_1} + e^{-x_2 + x_1^2/2}$
- minimized by sequence:

 $x_t = (t, t^2) = t^2 e_2 + t e_1$ 

where  $e_1 = (1, 0)$  and  $e_2 = (0, 1)$ 



- in  $\mathbb{R}^2$ , recall:  $f(x_1, x_2) = e^{-x_1} + e^{-x_2 + x_1^2/2}$
- minimized by sequence:

$$
\mathbf{x}_t = (t, t^2) = t^2 \mathbf{e}_2 + t \mathbf{e}_1 \ \rightarrow \ \overline{\mathbf{x}} = \omega \mathbf{e}_2 + \omega \mathbf{e}_1
$$

where  $e_1 = (1, 0)$  and  $e_2 = (0, 1)$ 



- in  $\mathbb{R}^2$ , recall:  $f(x_1, x_2) = e^{-x_1} + e^{-x_2 + x_1^2/2}$
- minimized by sequence:

$$
\mathbf{x}_t = (t, t^2) = t^2 \mathbf{e}_2 + t \mathbf{e}_1 \ \rightarrow \ \overline{\mathbf{x}} = \omega \mathbf{e}_2 + \omega \mathbf{e}_1
$$

where  $e_1 = (1, 0)$  and  $e_2 = (0, 1)$ 

- $\overline{f}$  minimized by  $\overline{x}$ 
	- $\overline{x}$  has astral rank 2
	- can show no other minimizers



- in  $\mathbb{R}^2$ , recall:  $f(x_1, x_2) = e^{-x_1} + e^{-x_2 + x_1^2/2}$
- minimized by sequence:

$$
\mathbf{x}_t = (t, t^2) = t^2 \mathbf{e}_2 + t \mathbf{e}_1 \ \rightarrow \ \overline{\mathbf{x}} = \omega \mathbf{e}_2 + \omega \mathbf{e}_1
$$

where  $e_1 = (1, 0)$  and  $e_2 = (0, 1)$ 

- $\overline{f}$  minimized by  $\overline{x}$ 
	- $\overline{x}$  has astral rank 2
	- can show no other minimizers
- $\bar{f}$  not continuous at  $\bar{x}$ : e.g.:

 $\pmb{x}^{\prime}_{t} = (t, \frac{1}{2}$  $(\frac{1}{2}t^2) = \frac{1}{2}t^2$ **e**<sub>2</sub> + **te**<sub>1</sub>  $\rightarrow \bar{x}$ but  $f(\mathbf{x}'_t) \to 1 \neq \bar{f}(\overline{\mathbf{x}})$ 



# **Outline**

- what can minimizers at infinity look like?
- constructing astral space
- what are astral points like?
- extending functions to astral space
- convergence of iterative algorithms

• in standard convex analysis, if  $\nabla f(\mathbf{x}) = 0$  then x minimizes f

- in standard convex analysis, if  $\nabla f(\mathbf{x}) = 0$  then x minimizes f
- say  $(x_t)$  sequence with  $\nabla f(x_t) \rightarrow 0$ 
	- must  $f(\mathbf{x}_t) \rightarrow \inf f$ ?

- in standard convex analysis, if  $\nabla f(\mathbf{x}) = 0$  then x minimizes f
- say  $(x_t)$  sequence with  $\nabla f(x_t) \to 0$ 
	- must  $f(\mathbf{x}_t) \rightarrow \inf f$ ? no!

- in standard convex analysis, if  $\nabla f(\mathbf{x}) = 0$  then x minimizes f
- say  $(x_t)$  sequence with  $\nabla f(x_t) \rightarrow 0$ 
	- must  $f(\mathbf{x}_t) \rightarrow \inf f$ ? no!
- e.g., in  $\mathbb{R}^2$ , let

$$
f(x_1, x_2) = \begin{cases} x_1^2/x_2 & \text{if } x_2 > |x_1| \\ 2|x_1| - x_2 & \text{else} \end{cases}
$$

•  $f$  is convex, continuous, finite, nonnegative, continuously differentiable everywhere of interest • let  $x_t = (t^2, t^3)$ 

- in standard convex analysis, if  $\nabla f(\mathbf{x}) = 0$  then x minimizes f
- say  $(x_t)$  sequence with  $\nabla f(x_t) \rightarrow 0$ 
	- must  $f(\mathbf{x}_t) \rightarrow \inf f$ ? no!
- e.g., in  $\mathbb{R}^2$ , let

$$
f(x_1, x_2) = \begin{cases} x_1^2/x_2 & \text{if } x_2 > |x_1| \\ 2|x_1| - x_2 & \text{else} \end{cases}
$$

- $f$  is convex, continuous, finite, nonnegative, continuously differentiable everywhere of interest
- let  $x_t = (t^2, t^3)$
- then  $\nabla f(\mathbf{x}_t) = (\frac{2}{t}, -\frac{1}{t^2})$  $\frac{1}{t^2}) \rightarrow 0$
- however,  $f(\mathbf{x}_t) = t \rightarrow +\infty$

• in this case:

- $x_t = t^3 e_2 + t^2 e_1 \rightarrow \overline{x} = \omega e_2 + \omega e_1$
- $\overline{f}$  not continuous at  $\overline{x}$

• in this case:

- $x_t = t^3 e_2 + t^2 e_1 \rightarrow \overline{x} = \omega e_2 + \omega e_1$
- $\overline{f}$  not continuous at  $\overline{x}$
- not coincidence!
- when assume continuity, must get convergence to minimum

• in this case:

- $x_t = t^3 e_2 + t^2 e_1 \rightarrow \overline{x} = \omega e_2 + \omega e_1$
- $\overline{f}$  not continuous at  $\overline{x}$
- not coincidence!
- when assume continuity, must get convergence to minimum
- general theorem: if:
	- $\nabla f(\mathbf{x}_t) \rightarrow 0$

•  $x_t \to \overline{x}$  and  $\overline{f}$  continuous at  $\overline{x}$  (with  $\overline{f}(\overline{x}) < +\infty$ ) then:  $f(\mathbf{x}_t) \rightarrow \inf f$ 

• in this case:

- $x_t = t^3 e_2 + t^2 e_1 \rightarrow \overline{x} = \omega e_2 + \omega e_1$
- $\overline{f}$  not continuous at  $\overline{x}$
- not coincidence!
- when assume continuity, must get convergence to minimum
- general theorem: if:
	- $\nabla f(\mathbf{x}_t) \rightarrow 0$

•  $x_t \to \overline{x}$  and  $\overline{f}$  continuous at  $\overline{x}$  (with  $\overline{f}(\overline{x}) < +\infty$ ) then:  $f(\mathbf{x}_t) \rightarrow \inf f$ 

• reveals structure and regularity not otherwise apparent

Convergence and astral continuity (cont.)

- can use to prove convergence of standard iterative methods applied to various ML/statistical settings
	- e.g.: gradient descent, coordinate descent, steepest descent
	- e.g.: logistic regression, boosting, maximum likelihood (which all have continuous extensions)

Convergence and astral continuity (cont.)

- can use to prove convergence of standard iterative methods applied to various ML/statistical settings
	- e.g.: gradient descent, coordinate descent, steepest descent
	- e.g.: logistic regression, boosting, maximum likelihood (which all have continuous extensions)
- don't require finite minimizer
- algorithms operate in  $\mathbb{R}^n$ , but use astral methods in proofs
	- rely on astral continuity properties (without which results do not hold, in general)

• can only speculate!

- can only speculate!
- in ML, usually minimize empirical risk function based on random examples
- sometimes, maybe, some (astral?) property of minimizer can imply generalization

- can only speculate!
- in ML, usually minimize empirical risk function based on random examples
- sometimes, maybe, some (astral?) property of minimizer can imply generalization
- e.g. AdaBoost minimizes exponential loss
	- finds solution with large-margin property, implying generalization
	- really an astral property of minimizer at infinity (namely, of first astron in representation)

## **Summary**

• tried to give a taste of astral space:

- its construction
- structure of astral points
- how to extend convex functions

## **Summary**

- tried to give a taste of astral space:
	- its construction
	- structure of astral points
	- how to extend convex functions
- aim: expand foundations of convex analysis to encompass points at infinity
	- e.g. to enable easier, more general proofs of convergence

## **Summary**

- tried to give a taste of astral space:
	- its construction
	- structure of astral points
	- how to extend convex functions
- aim: expand foundations of convex analysis to encompass points at infinity
	- e.g. to enable easier, more general proofs of convergence
- far more not covered
	- details at: [aka.ms/astral](https://aka.ms/astral) [or [arxiv.org/abs/2205.03260\]](https://arxiv.org/abs/2205.03260) (will eventually be published as a book)